[This article seems to have been rewritten and subsumed in a later, larger article ‘Protestant Cork decline 1911-1926 Murders, Mistakes, Myths, and Misinformation updated 10th August 2012’ with a new ending leaving out the phrase ‘pointless debate’ although it concludes in mid-sentence. (Keane has since told me this was indeed an eror).]

**PROTESTANT CORK**

**Advancing the story- re-examining the decline with minor source updates May 2012**

**Barry Keane**

|  |
| --- |
| **The Dunmanway Massacre: Murders, Mistakes, Myths and Misinformation - Re-examining the sources.****Introduction**Since the initial publication of *The IRA and its enemies (*1998) and the *IRA at War (2003)* as the considered view of the late Peter Hart the controversy has not abated. John Regan's article in *History Ireland**[1](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote1sym)* re-ignited the debate surrounding what is commonly known as the Dunmanway or Bandon Valley Massacre. It is distracting some scholars from new research no matter how valid the reason for the debate, and another line by line re-examination of the books would prove superfluous. However, it is impossible to avoid discussion of Hart in this debate, and even though this leads to repetition of other work it is necessary to clarify details for the reader. The purpose of this article is to use new material available on the internet to re-examine some of the evidence and conclusions in these stories.The habit of researchers referencing the work of previous scholars to make an argument has also lead to errors not only being repeated but amplified. Where an obvious mistake as been made this is dealt with by return to the original source to confirm the actual position. Finally, some researchers seem addicted to selective quotation to suit their argument, and where this has happened the full quote is provided to allow the reader make up their own mind.Peter Hart's work has been exhaustively critiqued by the Aubane Historical Society, Meda Ryan, Niall Meehan, and Brian Murphy among others. His work has been defended with equal vigour by others including Jeffery Dudgeon, and Professor David Fitzpatrick.[2](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote2sym) It is an intensely parochial debate focussed almost exclusively on what other Historians are saying, and some of the analysis is intense to the point of tedium. Other disciplines are neither referenced nor considered. It is not that they are difficult to find: ask who else might be interested in the Irish War of Independence, type it into any search engine and you will be more than rewarded with the results. There is a clear divide between the 'trained' and 'untrained' historians in the debate. No single book has generated such parsing, debate, and analysis, but with the advent of internet archives it is now much easier for scholars to make up their own mind by looking at the actual document. This article should not be seen as an attack on Hart, but an attempt to work towards the truth using the main source.While the 'Peter Hart' debate has become an increasingly bitter dispute among historians, it also points to an opportunity to appeal to the wider public. This will require more focus on teaching historical method rather than research to allow History reach out from the documents in a way it could not possibly hope to do in the past. History needs to be re-engineered, [3](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote3sym)**The joy of Maths and Statistics**Irish Historians and Geographers may have been taught *Statistics* as an integral part of a degree, but few have a background in maths. This is a function of an Irish education system that see students weak at science being encouraged into Geography and History. Much of Hart's excellent statistical work in *The IRA and its enemies* is difficult to follow for non mathematicians, and most people have been willing to take it at face value. This is a difficulty across Irish academia which embraced the computer in the 1980's without the reader really understanding the results. Many scholars ask Mathematicians to check their analysis, but others don't. This may be a critical weakness in Irish research.***The IRA at War;* key statistics**In *Part IV: Minorities at bay**[4](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote4sym)* of the *IRA at War* Peter Hart uses the 34% decline of the non Roman Catholic population in the the South of Ireland between 1911 and 1926 to say *'...this catastrophic loss was unique to the Southern minority and unprecedented: it represents easily the greatest measurable social change of the revolutionary period, being the only example of the mass displacement of a native ethnic group within the British Isles since the seventeenth century.'**[5](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote5sym)* While the mass displacement of 1 million native Irish during the Great Famine is ignored, the statement is not supported by the statistic. The reader is invited to conclude that the entire 34% decline was caused only by **native** Irish born Protestant migration, but it has been known since 1926 that 25% of the decline was non native military migration[6](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote6sym). It is wrong to conclude that all the decline was caused by native Protestant migration when it clearly was not. By way of example, 83% of all people reading this who expressed a preference agreed with this point, but how many of those who read it expressed a preference, and how many people read it? As the 34% decline is the starting point for the thesis that there were *'campaigns of what might be called 'ethnic cleansing' in parts of King's and Queen's Counties, South Tipperary, Leitrim, Mayo, Limerick, Westmeath, Louth, and Cork '**[7](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote7sym),* then it is absolutely vital not to misrepresent it as to do so undermines this argument in the first paragraph. This leads to further difficulties when applied to Hart's West Cork study area. The Roman Catholic decline for County Cork was 2.9% and the Protestant decline was 43%. In West Cork the Roman Catholic decline was 10% which is significantly greater, and the Protestant decline was 30% which is significantly less, My recent research has shown that the 'excess' Protestant decline in West Cork was 9%.[8](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote8sym) All this information has been freely available since 1926, and should have been the start point for any analysis, and not the tail end. My research on the Church of Ireland in 1986[9](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote9sym) is mentioned in the bibliography of *'The IRA and its enemies'-* which is impressive given the obscurity of the Journal of the UCC Geography Society- and showed that the military made up a minimum of 38% of the decline in Cork between 1911 and 1926.[10](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote10sym) This information was not used.Secondly, Peter Hart states *'Attendance at [Church of Ireland] Sunday Service averaged year by year was higher in 1918 and 1919 than 1911 or 1914. After 1919 attendance fell by 22 per cent, with more than two thirds of the decline taking place in a single year-1922. Methodist congregations in Cork followed an almost identical path, as did congregations throughout the three southern provinces. Methodist membership was higher in 1918, 1919, and 1920 than in 1914, but fell precipitously thereafter. Once again 1921-23 were the crucial years accounting for 74% of the decline'.**[11](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote11sym)* This suggests there was dramatic population loss without any explanation other than native Protestants fleeing from IRA violence. In 1911 there were 16,000 British military in Ireland.[12](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote12sym) This had risen to 60,000 by 1919.[13](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote13sym) As the British Army in Ireland was overwhelmingly English and Protestant, and West Cork was flooded with thousands of British troops in 1919-1922[14](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote14sym) it is reasonable to expect an increase at Church of Ireland services in these areas. As neither the 1914 figure nor the 1919 figure is revealed the only fact presented is that Church of Ireland, and (apparently) Methodist communities lost 22% of their congregations between 1919 and 1923. Hart suggests the Church of Ireland lost 14.52% (66% of the decline) of its congregation in 1922, while Methodists lost 16.28% (74% of the decline) of their congregations between 1921 and 1923. Furthermore, as Hart includes Carrigrohane Union in the statistics, and this contains Ballincollig military barracks with it 492 decline from 587 to 95 this wildly distorts his figures and timing as it was evacuated in May 1922.[15](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote15sym) Why is this not the military withdrawal given that 30% of Church of Ireland congregations, and 16% of Methodists were foreign born military in 1911?[16](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote16sym) In short, what does it prove?**Claims of Ethnic Cleansing and sectarianism**These are the most contested of Hart's claims, and we have evidence that at least one IRA commander recognised that there was an element of sectarianism within the Catholic population. In *Guerilla Days in Ireland* Tom Barry states *'Alas religious bigotry was not confined to the Protestants for the ignorant and petty minded Catholics too, had their fair share of this ancient curse'.**[17](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote17sym)* Later in the same book Barry lays out the brutal logic for the destruction of the 'big houses': strikingly the language he uses is couched in terms of the lessons learned from the burning of the Boer houses by the British in 1902. The justification uses exclusively nationalist rhetoric.[18](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote18sym) Barry is being honest when he says that in response to the Essex regiment *'..I was ruthless, daring, savage, blood thirsty, even heartless. The clergy called me and my comrades murderers; but the British were met with their own weapons. They had gone in the mire to destroy us and our nation and down after them we had to go.'* and there is equally no doubt that he regretted some of the actions he took, but his view was that *'From February 1921 terror would be met with counter terror'*.[19](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote19sym) This is the essential logic of guerilla war.The general view in the House of Commons throughout the period from 1920 to 1923 was that sectarian relations in the South and West of Ireland were substantially different to Ulster.[20](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote20sym) In August 1920 Lieutenant Commander Kenworthy bizarrely argued against gun licenses stating,*'An hon. and gallant Member representing one of the Southern constituencies in Ireland bears me out in this. His co-religionists in the South and West have left alone the Unionists and Protestants as such, and impartial and fair-minded testimony has been borne to that fact in this House, and by the Moderator of the Presbyterian Church in Ireland, and others whose words carry weight.*'[21](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote21sym)While there was obvious panic around the time of the murders in April 1922 this was exceptional despite the best efforts of Ulster Unionist M.P.s to suggest that there was a sectarian campaign being conducted against Protestants in the South. Even the House of Lords was almost more concerned with military 'reprisals' four weeks before the Kilmichael ambush than with the campaign of the IRA.[22](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote22sym) On the same day in the Commons a Vote of Censure in Sir Hamar Greenwood's handling of the situation was defeated by 346 votes to 79, but the debate is telling in the way that the opposition destroyed the Irish Secretary's denials of 'Black and Tan' misbehaviour. Greenwood is already talking of generous Home Rule- he only had a problem with the word independence.[23](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote23sym) Even the *other* 'Treaty debates' in the House of Commons and House of Lords were characterised more by prophetic worries about the implementation of *Ne Temere* as a legally binding contract in the South, than with sectarianism[24](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote24sym) However, there was another narrative also present from both Ulster Unionist, and Southern unionist members, which pointed to individual massacres, and atrocities perpetrated against Protestants based on their religion. Tempers were sometimes short, and robust personal exchanges were not unusual as can be observed in the above debate, especially between the Member for Falls (Joe Devlin), and the Member for Finchley (Colonel Newman)[25](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote25sym)Peter Hart allegedly claimed that what happened in Cork was an example of ethnic cleansing caused by underlying sectarianism. There is confusion about his use of this phrase, and he appears confused himself. In 2006 he stated *I have never argued that “ethnic cleansing” took place in Cork or elsewhere in the 1920's- In fact quite the opposite.**[26](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote26sym)* On page 246 of *The IRA at War* he states *'What happened in Southern Ireland did not constitute “ethnic cleansing”'.* The reader has been invited to consider that *'campaigns of what might be called 'ethnic cleansing' in parts of King's and Queen's Counties, South Tipperary, Leitrim, Mayo, Limerick, Westmeath, Louth, and Cork* took place on page 237, but Hart never actually called it ethnic cleansing. His opponents have concentrated on the 1992 thesis, the 1998 *The IRA and it enemies**[27](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote27sym)*, and the 2003 *The IRA at War* to argue their case, but none seem to be aware of his 1993 article in *Cork History & Society,* which was published by UCC. He stated '*The gunmen wanted revenge, but they also wanted to exterminate or drive away all Protestants in the area. This idea of a final settlement of old grievances was a common one in 1921 and 1922'.**[28](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote28sym)* The United Nations definition of Ethnic Cleansing *is 'a purposeful policy designed by one ethnic or religious group to remove by violent and terror-inspiring means the civilian population of another ethnic or religious group from certain geographic areas'.**[29](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote29sym)* WhatHart alleges in 1993 is ethnic cleansing, is it not? He is entitled to have revised his position in 1998, and again in 2003, but in his first published article[30](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote30sym) his view is clear.British Cabinet papers[31](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote31sym) for the period (now available online free) and referenced in Calton Younger's *Ireland's Civil War**[32](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote32sym)* published in 1969 show the British Government were shocked but not particularly concerned. General McCready, Commander-in-Chief Ireland, refers directly to the Dunmanway murders on April 29th, but also says that the situation in the South is improving. Churchill reported on May 16th that the refugee problem was not large in volume, but if the situation became worse there might a large stream of refugees. Lloyd George noted that there had been 37 murders in the South from 6 December 1921 to 30 May 1922 at the cabinet meeting of that date. Churchill told the House of Commons the day before that *'The number of members of the Royal Irish Constabulary murdered in since the signing of the Treaty on the 6th December, 1921, is 26, of whom 15 were Roman Catholics and 11 Protestants. The number of ex-members of the force murdered since that date is eight, of whom five were Roman Catholics and three Protestants'* across the whole of Ireland.[33](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote33sym)Lloyd George felt while there some merit in holding a Judical Inquiry into the murders in Belfast one in the South was neither necessary nor appropriate as the IRA had committed those, and the Free State was a dominion so not part of the UK. Hart however claims that out of more than 200 people shot by the IRA 70 (36%) were Protestant. This would be five times greater than their percentage of the population. He argues that this is evidence that they were targeted for their religion.[34](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote34sym)Lloyd George got the information on the southern murders from Michael Collins when they met in Downing Street that morning. He reported that Collins said the Dunmanway murders occurred as a result of the Belfast pogroms, and continued that Collins and Griffith, '...*talked of the extermination of the Catholics. I retorted that that was a great exaggeration, 80 Catholics have been killed, and 168 wounded since December 6th, 1921. They are considerable figures, but they do not Justify Mr. Collins description. It just happens that 72 Protestants have been killed, and considerable numbers wounded. We could get Mr. Collins to talk of nothing else, and when we were at last able to point out that there had been 37 murders in the South, he replied that this was due to the excited state of feelings provoked by Belfast**[35](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote35sym), and that unless something were done the whole of Ireland would get out of hand.'**[36](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote36sym)*When asked why he was not giving protection to the RIC and the Unionists, Collins replied *'he does in fact provide protection and prevents many outrages'*, and behind '*fanatical republicans who were pure in motive'* there were *'desperate elements of the population who pursued rapine for private gain'*. There was concern on both sides that the situation could deteriorate, but there is no evidence at British Cabinet level that there was any massive flood of refugees. There was undoubted political concern that if any such flow developed it could have a negative effect in the UK, Churchill's suggestion on May 16th that the British might have to set up a Pale around Dublin would probably have brought a few wry smiles around the Cabinet table.In another context the *Irish Times* argued throughout 1922 that what was happening in the South and West was not sectarianism but greed. In this they agreed with Michael Collin's analysis of 30th May. Its leader on October 3rd is a good example,*'We can detect no signs of a 'well organised system' in this campaign of destruction. The ex-Unionists have not been the only victims. They have been the chief victims, because their local isolation, and their relatively high standard of prosperity have made them easy marks for lawlessness and greed.'**[37](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote37sym)*The *Irish Times* continued: the vast majority of ex-Unionists had not fled, they were willing to tough it out, and as Irishmen they were willing to serve the new state.If anyone was going to provide direct evidence of the effect on the Protestant population of the Dunmanway murders Bishop Rowse of the United Diocese of Cork, Cloyne, and Ross in his annual report to the Diocesan Synod in October 1922 would have done so. He stated that six Church of Ireland clergy (and presumably their families) had left for England, but two of them had returned.[38](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote38sym) He called the Dunmanway murders *'ghastly massacres'*, and highlighted that '*the Cork Roman Catholic Young Men's Association had expressed their utter abhorrence of the terrible murders perpetrated in West Cork, and tendered their sympathy to their fellow countrymen,'* along with Cork Corporation, and the Cork Harbour Commissioners. He acknowledged that some *'have had to leave, but we can never value too highly the courage and resolution of those who have determined to stand fast.'* In the second half of the speech he looks forward, and sets out the terms of Protestant citizenship in the new state. He says *'our full rights of our citizenship are not to be conceded to us as favours; they are fundamental rights; they are rights attaching to every man, and we recognise with satisfaction that our present government regards them as such'.* He concludes by saying that the right course of action was to continue to remain and expect that *'the future holds days of great opportunity for those who refuse to be cast down.'**[39](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote39sym)* It would be hard to suggest these are the words of a cowed and frightened minority, and Cork had borne the brunt of the fighting in the War of Independence. At the next synod he is even more explicit, and states that the Church of Ireland had lost 8% of its population in the past 2½ years (Jan 1921- June 1923). While he does not provide a source for this figure each parish was required to submit an annual return of Protestant numbers to the Bishop, and these 'blue sheets' where freely available in the Diocesan Office when I was researching Protestant decline in 1986. The remainder of the speech is again a call to arms and a demand that the members of the Church become part of the *'doing class'.*[40](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote40sym) In 1924 he remarked on the passing of Lord Bandon, and stated that*'he was a man who lived among his people, and loved his native land; that any should be found capable of burning his home and wrecking his life seemed incredible. Yet, this was done, and Ireland's name was stained with crime'.**[41](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote41sym)* These words were spoken less than a year after the Civil War. If there had been '*the mass displacement of a native ethnic group'* then Bishop Rowse of all people would have said so. It was not his style to do otherwise.At another level Hart presents a detailed list of victims in *The IRA and its enemies*,[42](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote42sym) and suggests why they were attacked. While the details are personally horrific there is still little evidence of a targeted policy of intimidation by the IRA. Adapting Boer strategy Collins instigated a policy of making it impossible for the British Military to operate, and discouraged any military contact no matter how innocent.[43](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote43sym) This point has not been given sufficient weight in the debate. Terence McSwiney was actively de-constructing the British state in Cork before his arrest on August 12th 1920. On 14 July 1920 he wrote to Daniel Corkery seeking a General Order requiring all English Justices of the Peace to resign.[44](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote44sym) By 25th October 1920 the House of Commons was told that 1,069 out of 5,000 had resigned.[45](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote45sym) This doesn't tell the full story, and in a question on 28th October Sir Hamar Greenwood told Mr. Moles that in the six counties of Ulster up to 30th September 62 out 1,379 had resigned. In Antrim the figure was zero out of 303.[46](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote46sym) This also means that out of the 3,621 Justices of the Peace in the 26 counties 1,007 (27%) had resigned. A 1920 manuscript in the archives details his methodology in winding up the RIC including compulsory resignations organised by deputations visiting their homes and emphasising to their families the necessity of retiring,[47](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote47sym) and extraordinarily asking them to swap sides.[48](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote48sym) 890 RIC had resigned across the country up to 9th August 1920, with 62% taking place from 31st May. According to Niamh Brennan *'It had survived the killing of over 400 members, the injury of 725, and the resignation of almost 2,000'*, and in June 1922 the Southern Irish Loyalist Relief Association stated *'it had assisted 3,000 RIC men who had fled from Ireland in fear of their lives*.'[49](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote49sym)This was a new type of war. The side who could suffer the most would triumph in the court of public opinion, which is really where the war was fought. By 1921 anyone who still supported the British no matter how innocuous became, to use that dreadful phrase, 'a legitimate target'. Shooting Alfred Cotter in his mother's house in Ballineen because he was supplying bread to the army in Bandon is an appalling event in any normal society.[50](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote50sym) Yet there is a vicious logic to it; if you can cut off the supply of food to the occupying power then that power cannot function. The same reasoning applied to the railwaymen's refusal to move army supplies around the country. The methods of low-level total warfare by inferior forces was adopted by Ho Chi Minh in the Vietnam War against the vastly superior American forces with similar results.[51](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote51sym)***Using online sources to improve evidence.***It would be churlish to criticise Peter Hart's examination of some of his examples, but with the placing of a vast quantity of primary documents online over the past fifteen years it is appropriate to re-examine them. He quotes extensively from the submission of John Bolster Barrett of Kilbrittian to the Irish Grants Committee[52](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote52sym). This is a key quote as elements of it crop up again and again as a graphic example of the terror. Hart states that the historian must '*always ask in whose interest a statement is made*'.[53](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote53sym) The Irish Grants Committee is not explained until later in the book,[54](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote54sym) and as Mr. Bolster Barrett was seeking compensation from the British Government as a loyal victim, it was in his interest to make sure that his difficulties were as dramatic as possible. Hart suggests that Mr. Bolster Barrett's troubles are typical of the IRA war against Protestants, but they are only typical of the IRA war against loyalists?[55](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote55sym)Mr. Barrett was twice told that *'all the Protestants in West Cork were going to be shot'*. He *'therefore had to sleep in the fields'* and his wife had to secretly bring him food. The obvious question is not asked. If **all** Protestants were to be shot why did he leave his wife vulnerable in his house and go into hiding himself? John's Census return for the Barrett family in Laherne (Kilbrittain South) in 1911 shows his brother William Barrett described as a *'Trooper of South Irish Horse*'.[56](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote56sym) It may suggest a more political motive than the strictly sectarian one advanced by Peter Hart, but this evidence is not presented. Hart's own view is to '*look at all the evidence before coming to your conclusion'*.[57](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote57sym) He used the 1911 census when researching the people shot in the Dunmanway killings, and it is unfortunate that he did not do so for Barrett.[58](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote58sym) If he had looked at the 1926 census for Laherne he would have found that the Protestant population of the district **increased** by 7 from 32 to 39 or 21%. Kilbrittain's Protestant population declined by 7 from 19 to 12, which was the family of the local Protestant RIC Sergeant who died in 1911.[59](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote59sym) Kilbrittian and Laherne *'were a hot zone of of republicanism and violence',**[60](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote60sym)* but that does not seem to have been directed at Protestants.In the next sub-section ***How sectarian was the revolution?*** Hart deals with the case of hotelier R.C. (Richard Christopher, or Dick) Williams from Coolcower House in Macroom. Hart states, *'In the Irish revolution an unobtrusive unionist was still a unionist as Richard Williams found out when the IRA burned his house outside Macroom in June 1921. His situation could stand for that of thousands of others'.**[61](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote61sym)*Mr. Williams was not an unobtrusive unionist, he was still a Justice of the Peace in 1921[62](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote62sym) and remained a member of the uncompromising Irish Unionist Alliance after the split with the Anti-Partition League in 1919,[63](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote63sym) which might suggest another motive. *Thom's Directory* of 1921 shows R.C. Williams was appointed in 1906, and it is a salient and relevant point.[64](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote64sym) Neither the house's strategic position on the River Lee to the south of the town, nor the fact that Dick William's hotel was used by the Auxiliaries is considered.[65](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote65sym) These may be valid motives for the burning, but as they are not presented the reader is not able to decide their relevance.Dick Williams did not flee, he was compensated, the house was rebuilt, and he ran his hotel until the 1950's, when it was sold to the current owners and renamed the Castle Hotel. In December 1923 he was elected Chairman of Macroom Golf Club, and was crucial in purchasing Macroom Castle demesne from Lady Ardilaun for the town golf course. The hurt caused by the anti-Treaty IRA's destruction of her Castle is evident in her reply from her home[66](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote66sym) in St. Stephen's Green. She concludes *'I am pleased to think that at all events the old inhabitants and the best elements in the town grieve with me for this great loss.'**[67](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote67sym)*The burning of a Protestant social hall in Bandon has been presented as evidence that the IRA extended its campaign against all protestants. [68](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote68sym) As always the actual story is both simpler and more complex that this. The original source Liam Deasy[69](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote69sym) actually stated that, *the Allin Institute was a Protestant social hall commanding the main bridge crossing the river in Bandon town, and it was earmarked for enemy occupation. It was a rather substantial building, and had a considerable strategic importance because of its position.*[70](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote70sym)and from a military point of view this is an entirely correct. It is still extant today; anyone who stands at its front door will appreciate its strategic importance commanding the bridge, river, railway station, and four main roads. Any military commander would have to occupy this building or the Methodist Church on the other side of the bridge.[71](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote71sym) However, it is possible that revenge was also a motive. On April 14/15th 1921 the 1798 monument called the *Maid of Eireann* on Bandon bridge was destroyed and thrown into the river by Unionists (allegedly members of the Allin Institute) and by the British army using an armoured car.[72](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote72sym) The hall was burned three months later. St Peter's Church of Ireland was broken into in 1924, and the Town Mace stolen, but there is no suggestion that the motive was anything other than robbery. St. Patrick's Roman Catholic Church was similarly desecrated in 1905.[73](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote73sym)Of course Irish Historians are not the only group to have an abiding interest in the Irish War of Independence. Counter-insurgency and Counter-terrorism specialists regularly review and research the war from the perspective of how the overwhelmingly superior British forces failed to achieve their aims in a *Military Operation Other Than War (MOOTW)*. Writing at the same time as Hart Lieutenant Commander Michael Fierro of the US Navy shows that the effectiveness of the British response changed fundamentally in 1921, but by then the previous ineptitude and failure to accept that they were already at the end-game of an insurgency by 1918 meant that their good work came too late. However, they managed to fight their way back to a draw allowing British politicians to offer less favourable terms than might have been offered in January 1921. As a very different and succinct analysis of the war which draws heavily on three core sources of Townshend, Bowden, and Mockaitis it gives a dispassionate perspective, and should be essential reading for any student of the period.[74](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote74sym) A military think tank called the Cornwallis Group[75](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote75sym) held a seminar entitled *'Analysis of Societal Conflict and Counter-Insurgency'* in 2009. Gordon Patterson[76](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote76sym) from the U.K. Ministry of Defence argues that the British Government initially underestimated the effectiveness of the IRA campaign in the War of Independence, but by 1921 they had become very successful in limiting the ability of the IRA to operate everywhere outside Cork, West Cork, and Dublin. He concludes that the critical weakness in the British strategy was not once the War of Independence was under way, but in the period between 1916 and the middle of 1919. He states *'The biggest opportunity was missed during 1917/18 when Sinn Fein were able to claim legitimacy and begin to undermine British institutions. By the time alternative courts and tax raising bodies have formed and are seen as legitimate, an insurgency is deeply rooted and will be extremely difficult to overturn without massively coercive forces'.**[77](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote77sym)* If he is correct then the War of Independence was a pointless exercise not from the perspective of the Irish, but from the perspective of the British.[78](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote78sym)**Quality of source**To bolster the *Southern Star r*eport a friend of Mr. Williams, is quoted, *'They could have left him alone, I suppose, but they didn't leave anyone alone, that's the point'.**[79](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote79sym)* to show that the motive for the attack was sectarian.This is an anonymous quote made in an interview with Peter Hart. In researching this article I interviewed MK, EOL, NL, EOD, and MOC, and they provided me with a wealth of information about Ovens, (where Ballygroman Upper is). They are my mother and aunts. We had a chat for an hour, and I wrote down some of what they said. I might be telling the truth, but how is the reader going to know?**Dunmanway Murders April 1922**Between the 26th and 29th of April 1922 nine Protestants were murdered between the towns of Dunmanway and Bandon in West Cork. Another was murdered in Clonakilty, and another was shot and badly injured in Murragh. Three Protestant men disappeared- presumed murdered- from Kilumney thirty miles away in the Lee valley, and four British soldiers were kidnapped, and executed while on intelligence work at Macroom twenty miles north of Dunmanway.[80](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote80sym) While there is circumstantial evidence that members of the IRA may have been responsible, nobody was ever charged with the murders. Even if those murdered in Dunmanway had passed information during the War of Independence to the British Military as alleged by some historians this is irrelevant as an amnesty had been granted by both sides once the Anglo-Irish Treaty was signed in December 1921. Equally, the suggestions that the attacks were carried out by British agents rest on the testimony of Mrs. Alice Gray who recalled that when her husband was shot the killers said '*take that you Free Stater'* several times.[81](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote81sym) While there no doubting Mrs. Gray's recollection, there is no evidence trail that leads to the British. The leadership of the IRA were out of the county on 27th April at a final meeting in Dublin to avert the Civil War as reported in the Irish Times on May 2.[82](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote82sym) When they returned the killings stopped.Henry Kingsmill Moore was one of the first to use the term the *'Dunmanway massacre'* in his autobiography written in 1930.[83](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote83sym) He stated that it was in response to the Belfast pogroms, and gave details of the events *'from someone who was there'.* Tim Pat Coogan ascribed the murders to *'latent sectarianism of centuries of ballads and* landlordism' without evidence. Coogan also shows that Diarmuid O Hegarty (Irish Cabinet Secretary) accepted liability *'for the large and increasing number of persons who have been driven from their homes by intimidation',* and Hegarty repeated assurances given to the Church of Ireland by Collins that the government would secure *'the restoration of their homes and property to any persons who have been deprived of them by violence and intimidation.'**[84](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote84sym)* The accepted view was that the murders *'violently in conflict with the traditions and principles of the Republican Army'* were an aberration, and a stain on the West Cork IRA.[85](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote85sym) Hart had formed a different opinion from the same documents in 1998.Looking at the primary sources, Peter Hart rightly recognised the importance of the murders of John Buttimer and James Greenfield, and quotes their inquest extensively in the *IRA and its Enemies,* but it is relegated in *The IRA at War*,[86](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote86sym) Others give less weight to Frances Buttimer's account of these murders. '*Frances Buttimer (his wife) stated that she heard noise and shots- Her son said 'we are being attacked', and jumped out of bed. She became weak, but recovered quickly. She met her husband on the landing, and said 'for God's sake get out', and he said 'shure I can't'. Greenfield called on her to stay with him. She came down stairs, and met a man and said 'Where are you going?'. He replied 'Where are the men?' She said ' I do not know. What do you want them for?' He said 'only very little'. She said to him 'Take my house, my money, or myself and spare the men'. She put her hand to his chest to keep him back, and he pushed past her, and went upstairs calling on her husband in a blasphemous manner to come down. She went away from the house and returned after a while**[87](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote87sym) and met a man and said 'You have killed them, but you cannot kill their souls'. She went into the house and found her husband dead in a sitting position in Greenfield's room, and Greenfield was dead in bed'.**[88](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote88sym)* Anyone who reads her testimony must conclude that the killer was calm, and entirely focussed on his mission. Mrs. Buttimer's bravery in putting her two hands out to bar the way of an armed man who had broken into her home in the middle of the night, and who was looking for *'the men',* is sobering. Acknowledging the general prohibition on killing women, it is extraordinary that the gunman did not harm her person in any way, again suggesting that he was focussed only on his mission. The extract speaks for itself: this was not a random killing. The Buttimer family home was targeted for a reason; the killers knew who they wanted; and they apparently pursued the son relentlessly though the source is another anonymous interview.[89](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote89sym)**Protestant flight**There is absolutely not doubt that the murders resulted in a flight of some of the Protestant population from the area. On May 2nd an *Irish Times* article called *Sisters in Sorrow* about a meeting at Amiens Street (Connolly) Station between a Dunmanway Protestant woman going to Scotland to give her nerves a rest, and a Belfast Catholic woman returning to Belfast a month after her house was burned typifies the personal tragedies at the heart of the shootings. Another article on the same date noted ten Protestant families arrived from Cork into Belfast on Friday April 28th . They had been left to fend for themselves until helped by a member of the *Royal Black Preceptory* who took in seven families. The writer also notes press reports that large amounts of Southern Protestants were in Rosslare heading for England. The *Irish Times* didn't mince its words in its editorial on the same day,*'Nine innocent persons have been done down- apparently for no other reasons than they were protestants. The public conscience is shocked by this hideous- and in Southern Ireland- unprecedented outbreak of sectarian violence.'* *[90](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote90sym)*The paper went on to blame the power vacuum for the breakdown of order, and demanded that the Provisional Government take control of the country. The *Cork Examiner* noted the flight from West Cork on Wednesday 3rd May in a brief report, and the Constitution reported that the preliminary meeting for the Protestant Convention heard that,*'..until the recent tragedies in County Cork hostility to Protestants by reason of their religion has been almost, if not wholly, unknown, in the twenty-six counties in which Protestants are a minority'.**[91](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote91sym)*On May 12th *The Irish Times* quoted a leading article in *The Morning Post* asking did Lloyd George *'form a mental picture of a crowd of refugees streaming in this country with their harrowing stories of murder, outrage, and arson?.........It may at any time reach the dimensions of a flood. We are only at the beginnings of the Irish Trouble.* The Morning Post had a very pessimistic view of what the future held stating that *'the true government of Ireland at the present time is a secret society in close touch with our enemies'.**[92](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote92sym)*Sir Edward Carson eloquently summed it up in a House of Lords debate on May 11th when asked what were loyalists expected to do,*After being faithful to British rule for all these years, and fighting your battles—and these are the men who did fight—surely it is not much to say: "What do you advise us to do? Do you advise us to stay here till we are shot, or 'til we die of our nerves as a consequence of this terrible treatment, or do you advise us to emigrate to England?**[93](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote93sym)*The picture painted by Sir Edward is not supported in the *Irish Times* report of the full Protestant Convention in the Mansion House on the same day.[94](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote94sym) The report reiterates that until the murders in Cork there was little or no sectarianism in the South, but also notes that while murder would always be immediately condemned the cruelty of taking of a man's livelihood tended to excite less protest among citizens. This meant that these crimes got overlooked in the circumstances of the time. The Convention sent a delegation to Michael Collins to find out if Protestants would be welcome in the new state. As was expected Collins answered yes, and furthermore promised to restore everyone who had been a victim to their house and property. If that were not feasible- or wanted- Ireland would pay reasonable compensation via the British Government to *bone fide* claimants. The level of compensation was increased on all claims by 10% in 1925. [95](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote95sym)It is easy to conflate personal disasters with general panic and it is a fact that both the Methodist and Church of Ireland Ministers of Dunmanway declared that they had neither been attacked (as reported in early news reports) nor had there ever been sectarian trouble in Dunmanway.[96](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote96sym) The District Council in Bandon declared on May 8th that*'these cruel shootings were contrary to every conception of justice and liberty and to every sentiment of religious and moral obligation to one another,'...many of the men who were most 'wanted' in that strenuous time were sheltered and supported by their Protestant neighbours. There was no more need for fear or alarm. The trouble was at an end, and they hoped to live with their Protestant neighbours in the same friendly spirit as in the past'*. [97](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote97sym)How Bandon District Council was in a position to know this is a moot point, but Meda Ryan provides a wealth of verifiable information about the pro and anti Treaty IRA response to the murders across West Cork. This suggests that there was a clear intention to protect the minority after the leadership returned,[98](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote98sym) but no amount of good deeds or good intentions were likely to calm fears when the bloody evidence pointed in the opposite direction. Indeed, when the first reports reached Cork on the 28th the Cork Corporation declared that while they condemned Michael O Neill's murder they called on *'our men of West Cork to show every conceivable restraint in the present trying circumstances [of Belfast]'* and tendered *'our sincerest sympathies for the cruel and unusual murders'* of *'Protestant fellow countymen'*.[99](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote99sym) The motion was circulated to all public bodies including Cork County Council who objected to *'our men in West Cork'* being blamed, but otherwise did not demur. However, words were followed by action and many of those who had 'evicted' Protestant and Catholic 'land-grabbers' in Cork had been arrested, lodged in the county jail, and refused bail by May 19th when the *Irish Times* reported that that the police were determined to put a stop to such practices.[100](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote100sym) This suggests that the IRA leadership had regained complete control over the region 20 days after the last of the killings.This was mostly an urban flight, and it represented approximately 100 to 150 families across West Cork. Some fled to Cork and Kinsale, some fled to Bantry,- according to the Bantry estate archives in UCC[101](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote101sym)- some fled to Dublin and Belfast, and some fled to England. No reasonable person in the circumstances would do otherwise. However, the majority of native West Cork Protestants had returned or remained in place by 1926, and this is especially true in the rural areas.This is not to suggest that there was no reason to flee. Of the 30 senators appointed by W. T Cosgrave to the first senate 16 were ex-Unionists. After the execution of Erskine Childers Senators were warned that unless they resigned they would be targeted. 37 of 60 senators homes were burned, (along with that of Mr. Cosgrave) before the end of the Civil War. However, some of the house burnings throughout the period were terribly polite affairs. Correal House was burned on 14th June 1921 and the IRA *'regretted they had to burn the house, which they believed was about to be commandeered by the military'.* All contents were removed over a three hour period, and neighbours brought the goods to safety as the owner Mr. Walker found out when he returned. Other attacks were bestial and savage as Lord Carson reported to the House of Lords on 3rd July 1922[102](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote102sym) that an affidavit from a householder in Tipperary stated,*On Friday morning, June 22, about 12.30 o'clock, men smashed windows and demanded admittance. On opening the door I was forced by two men, one of whom levelled a gun at me, into a room adjoining, with an old gentleman, 74 years of ago, who lived with us, and they locked us in. Three men then entered the bedroom of his wife and all three, she says, outraged her. The whole party ransacked the house; they took everything of value that was portable, throwing everything about.**[103](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote103sym)*Despite everything it was clear that by 1923 the Provisional Government was beginning to deal with the collapse of law in the normal way. An alleged IRA attempt to extort money from a bookmaker called Joshua Mullineaux ended in the Police Court on 24th July 1923, as did an attempt by the *Evicted Tenants and Land Settlement Association* to redistribute land.[104](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote104sym)**Compensation claims for loss**The first interim report of the Irish Distress Committee on October 16th 1922 shows that less than 2,000 'loyalists' had asked for aid since the committee had been set up in early May that year. Unsurprisingly, at this time the majority of claimants were Roman Catholic with 909 from the South and 91 from the North, which were presumably RIC and Belfast refugees. It was estimated that the denominational breakdown was 50/50 on December 12th 1922, with the majority from the South.[105](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote105sym) However, a clearer picture emerged when the re-named Irish Grants Committee issued its second report on 2nd February 1924. The distress committee had received 7,500 applications of which 5,600 were for immediate assistance, and 4,330 of these were granted. The committee spent £23,943 in loans and grants with an average pay-out of £5. At the same time the British Government paid out £52,256 to the end of April 1923 in compensation. In 1924 the Grants Committee had dealt with 6,621 applications. 3,921 were for finance and there were 2,037 payouts averaging £9. The compensation amount had ballooned to £187,200, and continued to grow with claims being submitted up to 1930.[106](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote106sym) If both years of financial payments are added together this suggests the number of valid refugee claims was 6,367 across the island up to that time. Some of these were multiple claims relating to a single incident or family. The final report of the committee in 1930 stated that claims after the July 1921 truce had come to 4,030[107](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote107sym) with total compensation of £2,188,549 paid averaging £543 per claim.[108](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote108sym) The committee decided to resettle many of the claimants including the Ross family from Cork, who were resident in Chipping Sodbury, Gloucestershire in 1925. While the family expressed interest in a 1,000 acre farm at Castletreasure (just to the south of Cork city) high taxation was a deterrent.[109](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote109sym) Incidentally, in 1927 Robert Howe's wife Catherine (nee Fuller) was still living in the house where he was shot at Kinneigh, and in a letter discusses her compensation claim with her cousin Edward Fuller,*'I expect to be compensated by the English Government for Bob's murder. It is expected to be paid soon - I made the application more than a year ago. I got £350 a few months ago , it was left to Bob after his sister Annie's death so I claimed it. I don't know what we will get from England, my claim is £4,645 but of course I won't get anything near that.'**[110](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote110sym)*Irish Grants Committee claimants came from all religions, many remained in Ireland, and in other cases even when the option to return was available economic imperatives played their part to prevent a return. While they are an excellent detailed and personal source care should be taken when attempting to draw generalisations out of them. It is clear that even in Cork they deserve greater scrutiny than they have had thus far.**Mrs Lindsay, Frank Busteed and Dunmanway**The killing of Mrs. Lindsay of Leemount House Coachford is tangential to the West Cork massacre, but regularly appears as Frank Busteed the local IRA commander who claimed responsibility for this was an apparent link between the Dunmanway murders, the Hornibrook 'disappearance', and the British officers murders in Macroom. The linkage depends on who is writing (and when) as Frank is sometimes central and sometimes irrelevant. His version of the British Officers murders in *'Execution'* bears no relation to the known facts from newspaper and state reports of the time*.* At the time Mrs Lindsay's killing was a *cause celebre;* even reaching Virginia Wolfe's Diary in August 1922,[111](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote111sym) but she is more concerned with the layout and size of the print rather than any comment on the killing.Mrs Lindsay informed the RIC at Ballincollig that an IRA ambush was planned for Dripsey in January 1921 resulting in the capture and execution of 5 members of the ambush party in Victoria (Collins) Barracks in Cork City in late February.[112](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote112sym) She and her driver James Clarke were kidnapped as hostages and shot in retaliation. When General Sir Peter Strickland's diaries were placed in the Imperial War Museum, Terence de Vere White wrote an analysis of the Lindsay case for the *Irish Times* on 17 October 1978, which outlines the sequence of events.[113](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote113sym) Among other comments he showed that Mrs. Lindsay was a regular visitor to General Strickland, and met him on 2nd February 1921 when he '*found her in a great state. Apparently \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**[114](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote114sym) gave the information about, and thinks they know it'*. For some reason she was not taken into protective custody at this time, and was kidnapped a few days later. On 27th February the General noted *there was much worry re priests and executions*. On the same day the Dean (of St. Finbarries) brought her neighbour Mrs. Bowen-Colthurst to see Strickland at Victoria Barracks but her conversation was dismissed with the comment *that she is at the same old thing- so I told her nothing*. Mrs Bowen-Colthurst had been forced to sell her home and farm at Dripsey in 1920 as a result of a boycott to prevent occupation by her son Captain John Bowen-Colthurst who murdered Francis Sheey-Skeffington during the 1916 rebellion. At the court-martial of the Dripsey IRA she stood up in open court six months after her house was burned to offer a character reference for the accused much to the embarrassment of the court, and the IRA.The relevance to Hart is that he quotes a conversation between Mrs Lindsay and Frank Busteed recorded in *Execution,**[115](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote115sym)* Hart claims that this is evidence of an insurmountable ethnic barrier, but it is unfortunate that he doesn't continue the quote in which Busteed refers to his mixed Protestant and Catholic heritage.[116](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote116sym) *Listen you old bitch, you think that you are dealing with a bunch of farm labourers, the men who will touch their caps to you and say 'Yes, Madam' and 'No madam'. Well, we're no bunch of down-trodden tame Catholics. [My grandfather was Protestant and my bloody cousins are Protestants all over West Cork. This is not a religious war we're fighting. I don't give a damn for any religion.]*The section in the square bracket is not quoted by Hart. He also suggests that the chauffeur was shot in revenge and because he was an Ulster Protestant, but it is just as likely that he was shot as he drove Mrs. Lindsay on her fatal mission. The reader will have to make up their own mind on this, but there is little doubt that Mrs. Lindsay did: inform the military, was kidnapped as a hostage, and was shot in retaliation for the (unusual)[117](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote117sym) execution of six IRA members.**Truth matters more than reputation, doesn't it?**While there has been great enthusiasm to point out the errors in other people's research in the debate surrounding the Dunmanway killings- many of which are accurate- the motive appears to be to tear down the arguments of the other researcher rather than working towards the truth. If mistakes occur they should be pointed out and corrected: this should not result in a call to war.[118](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote118sym) However, if any researcher comes across new information that adds to or changes current thinking, then are they not honour bound to present that information fairly even if it damages their own argument and reputation.1. The census commissioners in 1911 and 1926 had a habit of placing a statistical table in one part of the census, and not referencing it in another part of the report. Researchers could happily read through the entire General Report of the 1911 census and there is no breakdown of the Anglican/Episcopalian community. The Episcopalian population of Ireland **was** broken down into Church of Ireland and Church of England in the Preliminary Report of the 1911 census,[119](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote119sym) This would have proved invaluable in 1926 when the Central Statistics Office were attempting to estimate the military and non-Irish element of the decline, but they clearly were not aware of it.[120](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote120sym)
2. Neither were they aware of the denominational breakdown of towns with more than 1,500 population in the General Report, as they note that this information was not available for Dunmanway in 1911. As it turns out it was not only available for 1911, but 1871, 1881, 1891, and 1901 as well. As a result the information presented the conclusions drawn, for Dunmanway district in *'Ethnic Cleansing?- Protestant Decline in West Cork 1911-1926'*, must be modified.[121](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote121sym) Dunmanway town's Protestant population declined by 107 from 236 or 45%, and the previous article downplayed Dunmanway's urban losses[122](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote122sym). This new evidence shows that flight from the town must have been a significant factor as the Roman Catholic population increased by 3%. Because of the centrality of Dunmanway to the debate about Peter Hart's research the small size of the 1911 population should allow individual analysis to work out precisely what happened when the 1926 census appears. A reasonable estimate can be made from Guy's Directory for 1914, 1921, and 1924 (all available in Cork City Library), and these suggest that 12 families[123](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote123sym) left between 1921 and 1924 though Guy's is not comprehensive.[124](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote124sym) The Protestant postmaster was replaced by a Roman Catholic: the Protestant Clerk of Petty Sessions was replaced by a Roman Catholic District Court Clerk, and of course there had been three murders. This is not to suggest that Protestant meant Unionist, but if you remained a local servant of the British State as late as 1921 it was unlikely that you would retain your position once independence was granted.[125](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote125sym) However, the Protestant population of the town had declined by 71 between 1901 and 1911 (23%), while the Roman Catholic population declined from 1,469 to 1,383 (9.4%) so it is important not to overstate these statistics. The rate of Protestant annual decline was unchanged between 1901 and 1926. Equally, the rural decline for Dunmanway North and South DEDs is four between 1911 and 1926, which is 1.8%, and suggests a very different rural dynamic in play.
3. Gerard Murphy's *The* *year* *of* *disappearances* states thatthree ex-soldiers were killed in Innishannon namely Edward Olliffe, Fred Stenning, and Colonel Warren Peacocke, and this was reported in the *History* *Ireland* 'Ethnic Cleansing' article. In fact, Fred Stenning was the estate sub-agent for the Frewen estate, and was responsible for collecting the rents in the village. He was 55 when he was shot on the 30th March 1921.[126](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote126sym) His son also called Fredrick was killed in the Great War[127](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote127sym), so the Fred Stenning shot by the IRA was not an ex-soldier in the normally accepted sense of the word. Edward Olliffe who disappeared on 10th July 1921 is noted in the list of the missing given to the British Parliament in August 1922, but appears nowhere else. Murphy suggests that he was 18 when he disappeared just after the truce, and assumes he must have been murdered.[128](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote128sym) However, Edward Olliffe from Innishannon arrived into New York aboard the *Cedric* from Liverpool on 26th November 1922 en route to his uncle in California so it appears that he emigrated.[129](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote129sym) It is possible his father also called Edward was the victim. On May 30th Colonel Warren Peacocke was shot in his garage by two IRA members. According to the newspaper reports and the Parliamentary debate on the matter he resisted the theft of the car, and was shot dead.[130](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote130sym) The IRA stated that he was working with the Essex Regiment in the area, and he was secretary of the Cork Branch of the Irish Unionist Alliance in 1920. Tom Barry does not name him in *Guerilla Days in Ireland*, but gives enough details to leave no doubt that informer 'B' is Peacocke.[131](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote131sym) According to Barry four Black and Tans were guarding the house on the night of the killing, but although they opened fire the two members of the IRA were not pursued. On December 12th 1921 Mrs Ethel Peacocke wrote from Coombe House, Bruton, Somerset in England and protested at the Treaty. She outlined a litany of suffering[132](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote132sym) and concluded '*Is there no statesman left', she asks, 'to say a word for the despised and persecuted loyalists?'* This is a political complaint rather than a sectarian one.
4. While the dramatic losses in Innishannon were considered in *Ethnic Cleansing?- Protestant Decline in West Cork* there was an obvious gap in the explanation. Further research has identified that seven loyalists (not all Protestant) houses were burned between the 16th and 24th June 1921. Mrs. Esther Peacocke's house was burned out two weeks after her son's shooting on June 14th, Mrs Stephenson's house at Castlecor, Colonel Godley's Riverview, the empty home of Fred Stenning owned by the Frewen estate, Michael Dennehy's (JP) home, and Brigader General Caulfield's rented home at Innishannon House (also part of the Frewen Estate) were burned over the next two days.[133](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote133sym) Castlebernard- Lord Bandon's home- was burned on the 21st.[134](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote134sym) On June 29th Mayfield House just outside Bandon, which was owned by H. R. Poole was also destroyed.[135](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote135sym) As these were all estate houses this meant that the mainly Protestant staff also lost their jobs. Nearby in Kilbrittain the castle owned by A.E. Heard (DM JP) who had retired to here was also burned on the 16th. At Upton, two miles north of Innishannon, the homes of William Beazley, Charles Harold and Mrs Eileen O Mahoney were burned on 23 April 1921.[136](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote136sym) This would help explain why the Protestant population declined from 237 to 87 in 15 years.Ryecourt, Warren's Court, Crookstown House, Coolcower House and Mount Massey[137](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote137sym) all near Macroom were also burned between the 14th and the 16th. Barry makes clear that this was an organised policy of reprisal against *Britishers* and known loyalists.[138](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote138sym) Many of these home owners were also members of the Irish Unionist Alliance.[139](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote139sym)

**The murder of the Hornibrook family.**Peter Hart states the trigger for the 'sectarian' massacre in Dunmanway was the disappearance of Thomas Henry Hornibrook, his son Samuel, and his apparent nephew/son-in-law Herbert Woods. He states that the rest of the killings were random murders of innocent Protestants by up to five different groups of killers- some of whom appeared to be drunk- in response or retaliation for Michael O Neill's murder.[140](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote140sym) The Acting Commandant of the West Cork Brigade based in Bandon drove Charlie O' Donoghue, Stephen O'Neill, and Michael Hurley to the Hornibrook House in Ballygroman Upper arriving at 2.30 am on the morning of the 26th of April 1922. Unsurprisingly, the Hornibrooks refused to let them in, so they broke in and Michael O Neill was shot on the stairs. He died on the roadside about 500 metres north of the Hornibrook house on the main Kilumney to Bandon Road. A small cross marks the spot about 1 km south of Kilumney. Charlie O Donoghue immediately motored to Bandon and returned with 4 other officers and confronted Woods, who admitted that he shot O Neill. The following morning Woods was declared to have murdered Michael O Neill at an inquest in Bandon.[141](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote141sym) O Donoghue would be seen these days as 'a person of interest to the Gardai' in the disappearance of the Hornibrooks as he is the last person known to see them alive. **These are the known facts.** However, Hart emphasises that O Donoghue returned with rope, which implies that someone was going to be tied up or hanged. There is no evidence for this, except an anonymous interview and local folklore. Anyone in the area would know this folklore, and Hart acknowledges that it is folklore in *The IRA and its Enemies*.[142](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote142sym) The rumour was also told to the later owner of Ballygroman House, and his source was Father Crowley the locally born parish priest of Ovens who was four at the time of the shootings (see below). Mentioning rope makes no sense until later, when Hart refers to Matilda Wood's statement to the Irish Grants Committee that Herbert Woods was hung, drawn and quartered.[143](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote143sym) The rope comment is used to lend credibility to the hung, drawn and quartered comment that appears in the Grants Committee claim and nowhere else.There is no proven connection between the Ballygroman disappearances, and the Dunmanway/Ballineen murders. They occurred at the same time, but there is almost thirty miles between them, and we know from the *Irish Times* on 28th April that the phone lines were down at the time.[144](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote144sym) Neither is there any known connection between the kidnapping and murder of four British intelligence officers in Macroom and the Dumanway murders, and the distance between these towns is over twenty miles.No person working with the sources of 1988 could have expected to unearth the information which is now easily available online about the Hornibrook/Woods family. There has been confusion about the relationships within the Hornibrook family, and it seems reasonable to clarify these. Alice Hodder was definite that Herbert Woods was their nephew in her letter to Lionel Curtis (British Cabinet Secretary).[145](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote145sym) The 1911 Census shows a Herbert Woods (aged 18) living with his uncle Edward Woods, and his aunt Matilda Warmington Woods (24) in Crosses Green Cork.[146](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote146sym) They were wine and spirit merchants. The census shows that Edward and Matilda married in 1909. In 1901 Samuel Wood Hornibrook, Edward Mannington (sic?) Hornibrook, and Matilda W. Hornibrook (14) appear in the Hornibrook household return at Ballygroman Upper. At that time Herbert Woods (9) is living in York Street, Rathmines with the Woods family who had moved there from Bandon.At no stage in any court report does she make any attempt to claim the Herbert Woods estate. Matilda describes Herbert Woods as their nephew, but fails to say who 'they' are in the 1927 report. As it turns out there should have been no confusion whatsoever; Matilda Woods clearly states that Herbert was her husband Edward's nephew in her Statement of Claim to the Irish Grants Committee.[147](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote147sym) Woods is called son-in-law by Peter Hart, and nephew by Alice Hodder within a couple of lines.[148](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote148sym) and everyone repeats the contradiction without comment despite many having read both the Woods Statement of Claim and the Alice Hodder letter. Meda Ryan inserts [Herbert Woods] into the sentence *My husband [Herbert Woods] and I were always staunch loyalists* in the Statement of Claim, though she quotes directly from the same Statement of Claim that says Herbert was her husband's nephew.[149](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote149sym) Do editors read what people have written, or is this so unimportant a point that it doesn't need clarifying? What standard are we expected to apply? If something so basic cannot be got right, then how are we to have confidence in the rest of the research?[150](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote150sym)Incidentally, in 1907 according to the Woodford Bourne archive in University College Cork the Nicholson family who were wine and spirit merchants in the city from 1829 to 1978 ended a trusteeship for the Hornibrook family,*Release made between Matilda W. Hornibrook, Ovens, Co. Cork, in the first part, Edward W. Hornibrook, Ballygroman House, Ovens, in the second part, James A. Nicholson (Merchant), Bellevue, Cork city, in the third part, and Frederick Nicholson (Merchant), Lochair, Co. Cork, in the fourth part. The Nicholsons convey a piece of ground on the north side of Elm Road, Thornton Heath, in the Parish of Croydon, Surrey, and the houses built on this land, held in trust for the Hornibrooks, who have now reached mature age.**[151](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote151sym)*Matilda states that she had no independent means in her statement of claim in 1927 so presumably this property now belonged to Edward. Mr. Nicholson, was condemned as a spy by Din-Din O'Riordan, and allegedly [152](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote152sym)shot in late 1920 by the ubiquitous Frank Busteed . Din-Din said that,*'he had been recruited by another IRA man who worked for Mr Nicholson of Woodford Bournes and that he got money from Mr Nicholson. According to O' Callaghan, the Cork No. 1 Brigade IRA got information from Josephine Marchmont Brown (who worked in Victoria Barracks for Capt Kelley, I/O) that Nicholson was part of an Anti-Sinn Féin Society and they shot him and the IRA man who worked for him. Three other businessmen (Alfred Reilly, Harrison Beal and George Tilson) were subsequently shot by the IRA as spies'**[153](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote153sym)*James Adams Nicholson died on 20th July 1920 aged 88, and was succeeded by Fredrick Norman Nicholson who died in 1976, according the firm's history- *The Story of Woodford Bourne.* Therefore no Nicholson was shot, but Charles Beale who was a manager in the firm was shot on 16th February 1921. His father-in-law and brother-in-law were Frederick and James Blemens abducted, and killed on 29th November 1920 as members of the 'Anti Sinn Fein Society'. The firm were victims of the change of government, and lost the Victoria Barracks contract. This resulted in a £6,200[154](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote154sym) profit in 1923 becoming a £110 loss in 1924.The *Irish Times* reports on 3 April 1923 *'Three men taken from home-never heard of again'**[155](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote155sym)* which is a description by Matilda Woods about the murder of her father Thomas Hornibrook, J.P.[156](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote156sym) and his two companions (unnamed in the report). Presumably the transcript of the case is now in the National Archives. She was living in *Glenbrae* on the Cross Douglas Road in Cork at the time of this court report,[157](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote157sym) and granted probate of the Thomas Hornibrook estate including the house and land as confirmed by the Irish Grants Committee submission. While there have been suggestions that the lands were seized by the Irish Free State,[158](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote158sym) this is clearly untrue. There is no doubt that she was given the farm and the house along with her brother Thomas H. Hornibrook who lived overseas in 1923[159](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote159sym). In her statement of claim she states that when she called to the house in July 1926 with Edward it was derelict and that the trees and fences had been cut down. In a 1928 report titled *'Taken away by armed party'* she probates the estate of Samuel Hornibrook through an affidavit before Justice Hanna. This second probate hearing discloses that Matilda is his half-sister, and generally summarises what happened again.[160](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote160sym) The graphic details that appear in her claim for damages before the Grants Commission in London are mentioned in no court report which presumably means they were not revealed by Matilda. **Serendipity**A number of days after the publication of *'Ethnic cleansing?- Protestant Decline in West Cork, 1911-1926'* my doctor stopped me in the local supermarket and informed me that he had owned Ballygroman house for a short time in the 1990's. He had collected a number of pieces of information about the history of the house. The day after he moved in he was told the Hornibrook story with the injunction that he should get a mass said 'as there was terrible murder done here'. He states that subsequent owners believed that the house was haunted. He had read the deeds, and had noted that Matilda Warmington Woods had owned the house after the 1923 probate case. He also stated that he had found a carpenters mark in the attic dated 1929, which means the house was re-roofed at this time-after the Irish Grants Committee compensation claim in 1927. He further states that he noticed a piece of Queen Anne furniture in the cottage of someone associated with the house- which may or may not mean anything but he thought it was relevant. Most interestingly he states that at a 'Station' in a house in the parish in 1925 the parish priest was served his meal on the best china- as was normal. Before he ate a bite he got up from the table and left, which would be seen as a terrible insult to his parishioners. The crest on the china was the Hornibrook crest, and the source was Father Crowley. While I have not given his name this is to protect his privacy, but I am sure if I asked him he would be willing to go on the record or at least talk to other researchers. After he sold the house he was invited to dinner which turned out to be a cover for discussing the history of Ballygroman, and this story appeared in the *Cork Hollybough*, 2002 written by R D Kearney[161](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote161sym). Kearney states that *'a retired British Army Major named Hornibrook lived there with his wife, son, daughter and her husband Capt. Woods'*. He later states *'After some negotiations the mother, daughter and maid were allowed to go free, but the three men were reportedly subjected to violent torture before being taken to a secret location where they were summarily court-marshalled (sic) and executed'.* Thomas Hornibrook was a widower in 1911, and Matilda was married to Edward Woods who lived in Crosses Green, This version of events is both incorrect and unprovable. Robert Kearney is the source for the article written by Eoghan Harris '*Digging up the Hidden Ireland*'[162](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote162sym), where Harris suggests that both Protestants and Catholics have conspired to hush up the details of this crime. While it is certain that Mr. Harris writes in good faith, his source appears to have based some of his reconstruction of the murders on rumours discussed around a dinner table. When the house was advertised for sale in the *Weekend* supplement of *The Examiner* in 1997 Mary Leland referred to the murders, and noted the facts that Mrs. Hornibrook still owned the house until replaced by Matilda Woods who was described as occupier on the deeds in 1927. Ms. Leland referred to the rumours of torture with the observation that *rumours feed on misinformation*.[163](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote163sym) It is difficult to disagree with this assessment by one of Cork's most careful, and well respected journalists.**Countries do not have morals, only interests.**Finally, a valid question has been asked as to why nobody was ever charged with any of the murders. The answer appears to lie in a letter written by President William T. Cosgrave to the British Cabinet in November 1922 (during the Civil War) talking about the intelligence officers murders in Macroom. *'All our efforts to trace the perpetrators on our side of these crimes have failed up to the present. In all the circumstances of the time we have felt compelled to reject as impracticable the holding of any immediate enquiry into the circumstances of the individual cases. We do not, however, intend to lose sight of the matter, and when we discover, as we shall strive to discover, the persons responsible, it is our determination to bring them to justice. We have considered the question of compensation in the cases for which it appears that our nationals were responsible. We have decided that, the other parties being willing, the best way of assessing the compensation which we propose to pay is to submit the cases to Messrs. Howell, Thomas and Dowdall (members of Lord Shaw's Commission nominated by the two Governments), and (if this course be approved) to request them to enquire into the facts and to submit recommendations as to the amounts which ought to be paid.'* The Duke of Devonshire recommended to the British Cabinet that it should accept Cosgrave's proposals with the following comment;*'I am therefore disposed to agree that at the present time compensation is the only way in which reparation for crimes committed in breach of the truce can be made. This frank acknowledgement of the detestable character of these crimes may be some comfort to the parents of the murdered officers, and I propose to send them copies of Mr. Cosgrave's letter. unless my colleagues inform me of any objection to that course'.**[164](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote164sym)* This was accepted by the British Cabinet.Politics is the art of the possible, and this was politics at the highest, most practical and brutal level between the two countries.**Conclusion**This article aims to correct our understanding of the issue through using new resources online to improve older research. As much written about this topic has either been incompletely researched, unverifiable, or supposition dressed up as fact, it is difficult to winnow out the fact from the fiction. It has often been necessary to return to the original source to examine its accuracy. To their credit those who have followed standard academic referencing to a verifiable source allowed this process to happen; the unverifiable sources should not be treated as being anything other than hearsay.The War of Independence was driven by nationalism, and as 1921 continued it descended into the mire of a bloody war of reprisals. While this may revolt some people, and others may question the need for it; the people involved at the time had no idea if they were going to win or lose. If they had known the outcome they may have stayed their hand. Equally, if they had not pursued the savage course they took would the British have offered a truce. Was the impetus for truce the fact that the Ulster Unionists had secured partition? These are the questions that need answering.The Dunmanway killings are different in that they occurred after independence. The Irish State failed to protect its citizens. No evidence has been produced to suggest that the IRA garrison attempted to leave the barracks and take control of the town, and at the very least this was a dereliction of duty. All we do know for certain is that 16 Protestant, and one Catholic[165](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote165sym) were shot or disappeared in West Cork over a three day period. Others of both main faiths were shot at or targeted for shooting. We know who shot four of them in Macroom, and we can suspect who may have shot the others. However, there was insufficient evidence to charge anyone with the killings. The murders were denounced by both sides of Sinn Fein, and vulnerable citizens were protected by the local Anti-treaty IRA. Civilians, and military were warned they would be shot if they didn't hand in all guns to the local IRA commanders throughout the area.[166](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote166sym) The killings resulted in the **emigration of a small number of native Church of Ireland and other Protestant members from the county, but the contemporary Protestant sources stubbornly refuse to suggest a sectarian pogrom; Bolshevik certainly, agrarian definitely, nationalist undoubtedly but sectarian exceptionally.** There is no justification for the actual Dunmanway killings. Even if each and everyone of the men shot were informers they had been granted amnesty by the truce. If they had breached the truce then they should have been brought before a court of law and tried. Whatever the reason for their killings, if the IRA were involved then it was a betrayal of their oath to the Republic. **However to use this event to argue that there was a sustained campaign against Protestants because of their religion is not supported by any of the evidence from the time Protestant, Catholic, or Dissenter.**It is important neither to understate nor overstate what happened in the revolutionary period. This was a savage period in Irish history. A vicious war using methods which eschewed the norms of war up to that point was fought to a draw in July 1921. This was followed by an even more savage Civil War, which led to a complete breakdown of law. Those with property, and known treaty supporters were most at risk, and ex-Unionists fell in to both these categories. The new Irish state did its best to protect all of its citizens, and yet there were appalling atrocities committed. The evidence does not support the theory that Protestants were targeted because of their religion. Historians are entitled to speculate, but in this case has the speculation run away with the story? **Is it time to stop this pointless debate, and write true history**?[Barry Keane’s letter in History Ireland May 2012 has much the same point][NEW ENDING - It is important neither to understate nor overstate what happened in the revolutionary period. This was a savage period in Irish history. A vicious war using methods which eschewed the norms of war up to that point was fought to a draw in July 1921. This was followed by an even more savage Civil War, which led to a complete breakdown of law. Those with property, and known Treaty supporters were most at risk, and ex-Unionists fell in to both these categories. The new Irish state did its best to protect all of its citizens, and yet there were appalling atrocities committed. The evidence does not support the theory that Protestants were targeted because of their religion. Historians are entitled to speculate, but in this case has speculation run away with t [end abruptly]][1](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote1anc)Regan John (2012) Dr. Jekell and Mr. Hyde in *History Ireland* 20(1) January/February Pages 10-13[2](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote2anc)All of this is considered in John Regan's article in 'The Bandon Valley Massacre as a historical problem' in *History* Vol. 97:325 available online. Professor David Fitzpatrick's repost 'Dr. Regan Dr. Jekell and Mr. Snide' is in *History Ireland* 20(2) May/June Pages 12-13.[3](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote3anc)For example most references in this article come from the *Irish Times.* This is because their archive is the most accessible to the general public, and is free in Public Libraries, and Schools. Other newspapers have similar reports.[4](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote4anc)Hart (2003) Pages 223-258[5](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote5anc) Hart (2003) Page 223.[6](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote6anc)Hart (2003) Page 227: Footnote 14. Hart also states that a great proportion of the Army wives and children were Roman Catholic and *'far more than an alien 'garrison': these were overwhelming Irish...'*. In fact most were English, or Scottish in Cork.[7](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote7anc)Hart (2003) Page 237.[8](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote8anc)Keane B. (2012) in *History Ireland* 20(2) March Pages 35-38 'Ethnic Cleansing?- Protestant decline in West Cork between 1911 and 1926'. Pages 35-38.[9](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote9anc)Keane B. (1986) The Church of Ireland decline in County Cork 1911-1926 *Chimera*; The UCC Geographical Society Journal Vol. 2 Pages 53-59[10](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote10anc)In 1911 there were up to 10,714 non native Protestants in Cork, and the total Protestant decline was 14,770. Most non natives were British military, and were forced to follow their job. Keane (2012) op cit. See especially Pie Chart on page 36.[11](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote11anc)Hart (2003) Page 225-226[12](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote12anc)Census Ireland 1926 General report Vol. X page 1946.[13](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote13anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1919/jul/21/treaty-of-peace-bill#S5CV0118P0\_19190721\_HOC\_410](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1919/jul/21/treaty-of-peace-bill%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0118P0_19190721_HOC_410) [14](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote14anc)In West Cork the Workhouse was taken over by the British Military to create a barracks where none had existed. If this was not available or was burned out on of the local 'big houses' was commandeered as happened in Millstreet when Mount Leader became the barracks. <http://www.corkarchives.ie/collections/>.[15](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote15anc)The religious make up of the barracks in 1911 was RC: 33, C of E: 447, C of I: 11, Presbyterian: 17, Methodists: 11. Online Census 1911. Hart states 'they [British army] played no part in the West Cork figures discussed above', (2003) Page 227. This is simply untrue.[16](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote16anc)Keane (2012) op cit[17](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote17anc)Barry (1949) Page 113.[18](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote18anc)Barry (1949) 'Fire with Fire' Page 114 passam.[19](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote19anc)Barry (1949) Page 99[20](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote20anc)See Hansard Online any search term including Protestant Ireland or Ne Temere will lead to the relevant debates.[21](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote21anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1920/aug/09/clause-18-application-to-ireland#S5CV0133P0\_19200809\_HOC\_426](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1920/aug/09/clause-18-application-to-ireland%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0133P0_19200809_HOC_426) 9th August 1920 House of Commons Firearms Bill Clause 18[22](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote22anc) The Marquis of Crewe highlighted the destruction of Mr. Cole's jewellery shop. 'I know of no reason why the troops should attack my shop. I am a loyalist and North of Ireland Protestant, and have always been on friendly terms with the officers and men.' <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/lords/1920/oct/20/ireland#S5LV0042P0_19201020_HOL_18> [23](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote23anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1920/oct/20/vote-of-censure-proposed#S5CV0133P0\_19201020\_HOC\_172](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1920/oct/20/vote-of-censure-proposed%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0133P0_19201020_HOC_172) [24](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote24anc)It is of course a great irony that it was a British Court that accepted the legality of the contract at the heart of *Ne Temere* where the children of a mixed marriage all had to be brought up as Roman Catholics.[25](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote25anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1922/mar/06/clause-1-provisions-for-giving-the-force#S5CV0151P0\_19220306\_HOC\_439](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1922/mar/06/clause-1-provisions-for-giving-the-force%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0151P0_19220306_HOC_439) Colonel Newman's House was burned on the orders of the Headquarters, Cork, No. 2 Brigade. 29th June, 1921. Major Newman, Newberry Manor. Owing to the recent destruction of several houses in this brigade area, I do now hereby order your house to be destroyed. He reported to the House of Commons that he had received £25,000 to rebuild his house as it was, on 24 February 1922 HC Deb vol 150. Of course he couldn't resist suggesting that bombs stored by the IRA had destroyed St. Patrick's Street.[26](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote26anc)Peter Hart (2006) Letter to *Irish Times* 6th June <http://www.irishtimes.com/newspaper/letters/2006/0628/1146660094382.html> [27](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote27anc)Hart (1998) Page 288 Hart states 'The gunmen, it may be inferred, did not seek merely to punish Protestants, but to drive them out altogether.'.[28](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote28anc)Peter Hart (1993) 'Class Community, and the Irish Republican Army in Cork' in *Cork: History & Society* Flanagan & Buttimer (eds.) Page 980.[29](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote29anc)http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ethnic\_cleansing[30](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote30anc)Post thesis article[31](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote31anc)Hart refers to the cabinet papers for casualty statistics more than the actual discussions. All cabinet papers relating to Ireland are available free online from the National Archives in London.[32](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote32anc)Younger C. (1969) *Ireland's Civil War* New York,[33](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote33anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written\_answers/1922/may/29/murders#S5CV0154P0\_19220529\_CWA\_43](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written_answers/1922/may/29/murders%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0154P0_19220529_CWA_43) See also 20 October 1920 Sir Hamar Greenwood to House of Commons. 94 RIC killed to that date Cork 22, Dublin 15, Limerick 15, Clare 15, Rest of Ireland 27. *HC Deb 20 October 1920 vol 133 l.940*[34](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote34anc)Peter Hart (2003) Page 234. See also The IRA and its enemies Page 304.[35](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote35anc)The 'Belfast Pogroms' were going on from 1919, so why retaliation occurred at the end of April 1922 when they had subsided needs to be reconsidered as a cause.[36](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote36anc)British Cabinet Papers for April-June 1922, Weekly report on the State of Ireland from the C-O-C, all available online from National Archives UK.[37](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote37anc)*Irish Times* Editorial 03 October 1922. Page 4[38](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote38anc)According to Guy's Almanac there were 93 Church of Ireland clergy in the United diocese in 1921. This would represent a 4.5% decline in one year.[39](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote39anc)*Irish Times* 26th October 1922 Page 7.[40](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote40anc)*Irish Times* 14th June 1923 Page 8[41](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote41anc)Irish Times 26th June 1924 Page 5[42](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote42anc)Hart (1998) Pp. 293- 314*[43](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote43anc)Irish Times* October 1st 1919. Page 6 Col. 5. Notices in Tipperary, Clare, and Cork warning that any friendship or communication no matter how innocent with enemy military and police would be regarded as High Treason.[44](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote44anc)Mc Swiney Papers CCCA P4/4/62 P4/4/63 P4/4/64[45](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote45anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written\_answers/1920/oct/25/magistrates-resignations#S5CV0133P0\_19201025\_CWA\_138](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written_answers/1920/oct/25/magistrates-resignations%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0133P0_19201025_CWA_138) Sir Hamar Greenwood to Mr. Swan.[46](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote46anc)[http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written\_answers/1920/oct/28/magistrates-resignations#S5CV0133P0\_19201028\_CWA\_11](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written_answers/1920/oct/28/magistrates-resignations%22%20%5Cl%20%22S5CV0133P0_19201028_CWA_11) [47](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote47anc)CCA PR4/4/92 Terence McSwiney Papers This led to unintended consequences; when the Irish Government attempted to pay the promised pensions for those who resigned for 'nationalist' reasons the British Government wouldn't give them the addresses. This mess of conflicting loyalties again points to the complexity of the break-up between the two countries. See *Compensating the Royal Irish Constabulary 1922-1932* by Niamh Brennan. <http://www.ucd.ie/pages/95/Brennan.html> [48](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote48anc)<http://www.corkarchives.ie/media/PR4web.pdf> [49](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote49anc)Brennan op cit.*[50](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote50anc)Irish Times* 28th February 1921. Aged 35, shot at 9.15 p.m. At his mothers home in Ballineen. No reason given. Master Baker.[51](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote51anc)The weaker side did not win but as they could be not be defeated the stronger side had to come to terms in the face of opposition from the general public at home. That these wars are fought by democracies in the full glare of modern communications makes it easier to sway public opinion.[52](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote52anc)Hart (2003) Page 224.[53](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote53anc)'Peter Hart and his enemies..*.'History Ireland'* 13.4 available on their website.[54](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote54anc)Hart (2003) Page 231.[55](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote55anc)The Grants Committee list includes (as would be expected) many Roman Catholics including Nationalist Irish Party M.P. for Mid Cork Captain D.D.Sheehan (CO 762/24/14), James Gilgan RIC Barleyhill (CO 762/10/11) and Agricultural Science Professor Thomas Wibberley (CO 762/12/10 ) among others. Many of the 769 Cork claims are submitted by individual family members about the same incident, and as such are duplicated.[56](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote56anc)<http://www.census.nationalarchives.ie/pages/1911/Cork/Laherne/Ballynagaragh/419287/> W. S. Barrett was captured during the German Spring Offensive of 1918 which resulted in the virtual annihilation of the South Irish Horse. The South Irish Horse website provides a wealth of detail about the regiments formation, and disbandment in 1922 <http://southirishhorse.com/> [57](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote57anc)Peter Hart and his enemies...' *History Ireland 13.4* (2005) available on their website.[58](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote58anc)As Laherne is a different District Electoral Division to Kilbrittain it is possible that he missed it through no fault of his own.[59](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote59anc) His Roman Catholic successor Edward Bolger who had been recorded in Ballyvourney RIC barracks in 1911, was shot in 1919.[60](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote60anc)Hart (2003) Page 224.[61](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote61anc)Hart (2003) Page 235.[62](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote62anc)[63](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote63anc)On April 6th 1919 he proposed a motion at the Cork Branch of the Alliance regretting the resignation of Lord Barrymore. *Irish Times* 7th April 1919 Page 4. The IUA split on 24th January of that year with Lord Midleton leading the Anti Partition League who were willing to consider Home Rule to avoid partition.[64](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote64anc)Hart used Thom's to state that Thomas Hornibrook of Ballygroman had resigned as a JP by 1921. R C William's name appears on the next page. [65](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote65anc) Dick Williams owned what is now the Castle Hotel in Macroom, and it was from his hotel that the four British army soldiers were kidnapped on 26th April 1922 as confirmed in a written reply to the House of Commons on 11 July 1922. <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/written_answers/1922/jul/11/kidnapped-officers-macroom#S5CV0156P0_19220711_CWA_12> [66](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote66anc) Rupert Guinness, the 2nd Lord Iveagh, continued to use the house on St. Stephen’s Green until the 1930s, when he offered the house to the Irish State. Following its presentation to the State, the house was officially re-named Iveagh House. <http://www.guinness-storehouse.com/en/docs/Iveagh_House_Iveagh_Gardens_St_Stephens_Green.pdf> [67](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote67anc)The letter can still be sourced at the Golf club in Macroom. A history of the castle is available at <http://www.foundmark.com/Macroom/history/index.html> Lord Ardilaun Arthur Edward Guinness gave St. Stephen's Green to Dublin. He bought Muckross Estate in Killarney from the Standard Life Assurance Company who foreclosed on the Herbert family in 1899. His wife Olivia was the 3rd daughter of the Earl of Bantry.. Jane, Countess of Bantry, was the youngest sister of Colonel Herbert of Muckross.[68](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote68anc) <http://www.reform.org/site/2002/11/30/fate-of-cork-unionists-1919-1921/> Hart *The IRA at War*[69](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote69anc)Liam Deasy (1973) Towards Ireland Free Page 294[70](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote70anc)See also *Ordnance Survey Ireland Historic Maps* available free online 25” version.[71](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote71anc)With the best will in the world no military commander is going to occupy a church if they can avoid it.[72](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote72anc)*Cork Examiner* 15th April 1921. See also *P Connolly (ND) Bandon: 400 years of history*. Page 179 see also Page 173 for Allin Institute. <http://www.generalmichaelcollins.com/Michael_Collins_Life_and_Times/4.YOUNG_MICHAEL_COLLINS.html> for a more detailed history of the Maid of Eireann's construction and destruction. The Unionist members of the town refused to pay for its construction in 1900.[73](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote73anc)Connolly (ND) op. Cit. 180[74](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote74anc)<http://www.dtic.mil/cgi-bin/GetTRDoc?AD=ADA325079&Location=U2&doc=GetTRDoc.pdf> [75](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote75anc) <http://www.thecornwallisgroup.org/mission.php> [76](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote76anc) <http://www.thecornwallisgroup.org/workshop_2009.php> The British Army’s Effectiveness in the Irish Campaign 1919-1921 and the Lessons for Modern Counterinsurgency Operations, with Special Reference to C3I Aspects.[77](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote77anc)Patterson (2009) ibid. Page 101[78](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote78anc)His article will probably be dismissed by some as he quotes Hart to argue his case, though for a member of the British Army he does refer to the controversy.[79](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote79anc)Richard was born in 1873, so would have been 119 when Peter Hart finished his thesis in 1992. Given the controversy it is surprising that Peter Hart never supplied a redacted transcript of the tapes he used for these interviews. Since his passing who is in possession of these tapes? Who has his other research material? [80](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote80anc)For some reason people insist in getting their occupations wrong. There was a solicitor, a chemist, a retired draper, five farmers, a farm labourer, an ex-soldier, a postal worker, an invalid, an unemployed youth, and four soldiers[81](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote81anc)*Cork Examiner* 1st May 1922 Page 3.[82](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote82anc) Letter from Dan Breen, Tom Hales, H Murphy, S O Hegarty, Sean Mullan, R A Mulcahy, Owen O Duffy, Gearoid O Sullivan, Michael Collins to Four Courts garrison to end occupation and allow a plebiscite on the Treaty. *Irish Times* 02 May 1922.[83](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote83anc)Kingsmill-Moore H. (1930) *Reminiscences and Reflections from some sixty years of life in Ireland* Pages 275 & 278-9. Kingsmill Moore's book that besides the Dunmanway massacre there was little sectarianism in the South. He had no need to make this case in 1930, but he did.[84](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote84anc)Coogan T. p. (1990) *Michael Collins:The man who made Ireland* Page 391.[85](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote85anc) Mc Ardle D. (1951), *The Irish Republic* page 705[86](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote86anc)Peter Hart (1998) Page 275 He quotes the Cork Weekly Examiner, but it is substantially the same.[87](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote87anc)According to the *Cork Constitution* there were three raiders, one of whom put her out of the house.[88](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote88anc) *Irish Times* Tuesday 2nd May. 1922 The *Cork Examiner* report is more detailed and also mentions a third raider[89](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote89anc)Hart was still interviewing Dunmanway locals in late April 1993 just before his article in Cork History and Society was published in June of that year. Hart (1998) Footnotes 274-275.*[90](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote90anc) Irish Times* Editorial May 2nd P 4 Col 4. Other articles on same page.[91](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote91anc)Cork Examiner May 3rd Page 3 and Cork Constitution May 3rd Page 3.*[92](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote92anc)Irish Times* May 12th 1922 Page 5[93](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote93anc) <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/lords/1922/may/11/situation-in> [ireland#S5LV0050P0\_19220511\_HOL\_40](http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/lords/1922/may/11/situation-in-ireland#S5LV0050P0_19220511_HOL_40) [94](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote94anc)Irish Times May 12th 1922[95](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote95anc) <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1926/en/act/pub/0019/print.html#sec2> See also the House of Lords debate of 15 July 1925 where the people most affected by the burning of the 'Big Houses' including Lord Mayo tease out the extent and effects of the Irish Revolution. [96](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote96anc)Irish Times Monday May 1st & Irish Times Tuesday May 2nd*[97](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote97anc)Irish Times* May 9th Page 5[98](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote98anc) Ryan Meda (2005) *Tom Barry: IRA Freedom Fighter Page 215.* I specifically went back and checked Meda Ryan's primary sources in this case, and she has accurately reported the facts.[99](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote99anc)Working from newspaper reports Hart unintentionally misleads by suggesting that there was two separate motions passed, but the minute book shows there was only one composed *ex tempore,* at the start of the meeting and passed unanimously. CCCA *Minutes of Cork Corporation 1921-1923* Page 246. [of Belfast] is inserted into the original motion showing that it was being composed in the meeting, and not beforehand as is normal.[100](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote100anc)*Irish Times* May 19th 1922 Page 5. This was in complete contrast to what Tom Barry had in mind for the large estates when he ordered that those which had been abandoned should be broken up **without being sold or compensated.** Barry (1949) Page 116.[101](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote101anc) Bantry Estate Archive No 1618 (25 November 1922- 13 December 1922). <http://booleweb.ucc.ie/documents/Bantryhouse.pdf> [102](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote102anc)Irish Times 16th June 1921 Page 5 The IRA are not mentioned but implied. The ring leader fled the Provisional Government.[103](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote103anc) <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/lords/1922/jul/03/outrage-in-ireland#S5LV0051P0_19220703_HOL_183>[104](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote104anc) *Irish Times* 25 July 1923 Page 3.[105](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote105anc) <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1922/dec/12/army-supplementary-estimate-1922-23#S5CV0159P0_19221212_HOC_633> S. Hoare to Col. Wedgewood Line 2801 1am in the morning.[106](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote106anc)See Catherine Howe letter below.[107](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote107anc)If we take average family size at the usual 5 then the total number of affected people would work out at 21,560. As we know that 1,000 claims were Roman Catholic this would suggest that Protestant claims came to a maximum 15,150. We also know from another source that by the end of 1924 8,160 British emigrants were re-settled out of Ireland to the other dominions. Finally 518 people left Cobh/Queenstown between July and October 1924. See Fedorwich 'Reconstruction and Resettlement: The Politicization of Irish Migration to Australia and Canada, 1919-29' *English Historical Review* Nov, 1999[108](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote108anc)Hansard 6th March 1930 <http://hansard.millbanksystems.com/commons/1930/mar/06/dominion-services#S5CV0236P0_19300306_HOC_727> [109](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote109anc)<http://www.flyingphotons.com/gen/bessie_letter_to_edward_1925.html> This letter suggests that after the Civil War high taxes needed to pay for the damage kept many of those who left from returning. Bessie Ross was a cousin of Robert Howe's wife. Robert was shot on April 27th 1922 as part of the Dunmanway Massacre.[110](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote110anc)<http://www.flyingphotons.com/gen/katie_howe_letter_to_edward_1927.html>. Catherine (Kate) died in [111](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote111anc)Annie Oliver Bell (1929) *The Diary of Virginia Woolf* Volume 2 Page 127 10 August 1922.[112](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote112anc)This was the official version of events recorded in the New York Times on 30 July 1921 <http://query.nytimes.com/mem/archive-free/pdf?res=F20E15F73C551A738DDDA90B94DF405B818EF1D3> [113](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote113anc)*Irish Times* (1978) October 17, P10, Col. 1 *The shooting of Mrs. Lindsay*[114](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote114anc)Blacked out in the original according to de Vere White[115](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote115anc)O Callaghan S. (1974) *Execution* Page 133[116](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote116anc)Hart (1998) Page 309.[117](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote117anc)Usually those sentenced to death had their sentence commuted to life in prison before this date.[118](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote118anc) For example, in an otherwise reasonable polemic to prove Hart wrong, Jack Lane states *'in Dunmanway those killed were clearly urban and professional people- solicitor, shopkeeper, chemist, draper, estate agent, clergyman, post office clerk, etc.'* to show Denis Lordan's comment about 'taking it out on the Protestants' does not refer to Dunmanway. Yet Robert Howe, John Chinnery, John Bradfield, John Buttimer and James Greenfield were all members of the farming community. Ralph Harbord (the clergyman) died in 1966 according to his gravestone. Presumably, these mistakes will be corrected at the first available opportunity. Lane (2012) *The Dunmanway Killings- Curiouser and Curiouser.* Page 12.[119](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote119anc) In March 2012 I finally accessed the preliminary report of the 1911 census at Histpop.org. I started research on this topic in 1983, and was never able to find a copy.[120](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote120anc)CSO Census 1926 Volume X (General Report) Page 46.[121](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote121anc)<http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/census1926results/volume3/C%2014%201926%20V3%20T11.pdf> Page 26[122](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote122anc) General report, Ireland, 1911 Page 223 http://www.histpop.org/ohpr/servlet/PageBrowser2?ResourceType=Census&ResourceType=Legislation&ResourceType=Essays&ResourceType=Registrar General&ResourceType=TNA&SearchTerms=1911 census general report Ireland&simple=yes&path=Results&active=yes&treestate=expandnew&titlepos=0&mno=459&tocstate=expandnew&display=sections&display=tables&display=pagetitles&pageseq=289[123](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote123anc) Roughly 60 people based on an average Protestant family size of 5, though urban families were smaller.[124](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote124anc) <http://www.corkpastandpresent.ie/places/streetandtradedirectories/> James Buttimer who was shot on 26th April 1922 does not appear in Guys for any of the years from 1911 to 1921.[125](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote125anc) This had been specifically provided for in the Treaty under Article 10. As of 21st March 1928 Minister Blythe stated 1,806 British Civil Servants had applied, or been asked, to retire under this clause. Dáil Éireann Debate V*ol. 22 No. 14 Page 4 Oral Answers* <http://debates.oireachtas.ie/dail/1928/03/21/00004.asp> Based on a ratio 1:4 per family this would suggest that 9,000 people were affected. On 21st February 1929 in the Dail Blythe stated that the total transferred was 21,035 of which 1,639 wished to retire under Article X. Dáil Éireann Debate *Vol. 28 No. 2*[126](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote126anc) *Irish* *Times* April 1 1921 Page 5[127](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote127anc) Ireland's Memorial Records Stenning Fredrick George 30/09/1918 France Innishannon, Co.Cork Killed[128](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote128anc) Gerard Murphy (2010) *The Year of Disappearances* Page 230. RIC Daily Summary CO/904/146 National Archives Kew 16/07/1921 referenced in Murphy.[129](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote129anc) Five of the nine children emigrated to the USA in 1921 and 1922 <http://genforum.genealogy.com/olliffe/messages/3.html> His son Robert died in 1979 in Washington, Pennsylvania on December 2nd Observer Reporter Page 35 Col 2., and his obituary identified the whereabouts of the other children including Edward C. Olliffe living in Walnut Creek, California. A sister Margaret Angus lived in Cork. <http://news.google.com/newspapers?id=e_RdAAAAIBAJ&sjid=lF8NAAAAIBAJ&pg=2469%2C290004> [130](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote130anc) Hansard 02 June 1921 Colonel Warren Peacockee, aged 32, an ex-officer of the Grenadier Guards and Inniskilling Fusiliers. Started Great War as second lieutenant but ended up commanding the regiment[131](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote131anc) Tom Barry (1949) Page 110[132](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote132anc) These are her son's murder, the burning of her home at Skevanish, the theft of the livestock, and the auctioning by the IRA of her machinery after the truce without interference from the British government.[133](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote133anc) *Irish Times* 16th June 1921 (op. cit.)*[134](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote134anc) Irish Times* 24th June 1921[135](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote135anc) *Irish Times* 29th June 1921[136](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote136anc) *Irish Times* 23 April 1921[137](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote137anc) Long repossessed by the bank, and empty at the time of its burning. In fact, it had claimed a victim the previous year when a young man who was trying to steal lead off the roof fell into the dry moat and died.[138](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote138anc) Tom Barry (1949) Page 114*[139](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote139anc) Irish Times* April 7th 1919 Page 4[140](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote140anc) Hart (1998) Page 281[141](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote141anc) Meda Ryan Page 212. See also *Cork Examiner* 27 August, Page 4 for a detailed account of the inquest where Charlie O Donoghue gives an account of his movements on the night and day of 25th -26th April 1922 up to the meeting with Woods in the morning after the shooting.[142](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote142anc) Hart (1998) Page 279-281. Hart's writing style blends proven fact with rumour and unverifiable interview in a compelling narrative. While it is a great story, can it be described as history? Each reader will have to make up their own mind on this.[143](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote143anc) The actual quote is 'Herbert Woods it was ascertained afterwards was hung drawn and quartered in the presence of my father and brother.' in her Statement of Claim to the Irish Grants Committee on 31 January 1927.CO/762/133/5.[144](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote144anc) They may have been cut on the night of the 26th to facilitate the Dunmanway killings.[145](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote145anc) 28 May 1922 National Archives Kew (CO 739/16). See also Tim Pat Coogan (1992) *Michael Collins: The man who made Ireland* Page 359 which quotes the letter in depth. This is before Hart published his thesis, and it is somewhat surprising that the easily accessible Coogan book is not referenced in *The IRA and its enemies.*[146](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote146anc) <http://www.census.nationalarchives.ie/reels/nai001886990/> [147](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote147anc) Matilda states 'One of the attackers was shot by Mr. (crossed out and replaced with Capt.) Herbert Woods, nephew of my husband, who was defending with the deceased and my brother.[148](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote148anc) Peter Hart (1998) Page 279[149](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote149anc) Ryan M. (2005) *Tom Barry IRA: Freedom Fighter* Page 211. The statements of claim are numbered I, II, III and the details of the shooting are included in II.[150](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote150anc) In fairness to Meda Ryan with the exception of this, and **the unavailable Dunmanway list of Informers** she is accurate in her reportage of facts taken from primary sources.[151](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote151anc) Item Number 171. Archives UCC <http://booleweb.ucc.ie/documents/WB%20Full%20List.pdf> [152](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote152anc) While Mr. Nicholson died in 1920 there is no evidence that he was shot.[153](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote153anc) DCU record End November 1920 <http://www.dcu.ie/~foxs/irhist/november_1920.htm> Hart says Reilly tried to save Terence McSweeney, and may have been shot because he refused to resign as a J.P.. Hart (1998) Page 299. Woodford Bourne rented a flat to ex-IRA commander Tom Barry in 1932, and he lived here until his death. (Item 54), which gives an idea of the tiny nature of Cork society.[154](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote154anc) £6,200 in 1921 was more than £350,000 today.[155](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote155anc) Irish Times 14 April 1923 Col. 5 <http://www.irishtimes.com/newspaper/archive/1923/0414/Pg006.html#Ar00610> [156](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote156anc) Thom's Directory shows Thomas had resigned from the bench in 1921. Guy's general directory also shows this, but the Oven's (Ballygroman) parish directory in Guy's states he is a Justice of the Peace. Which is correct?[157](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote157anc) Edward had left Ireland pre-truce, and Matilda had remained to sort out the probate on Ballygroman. They were living in 'Eastwood' Crowestone Road North, Westcliff-on Sea at the time of the Grants Committee in 1927.[158](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote158anc) Hart (1998) P. 279. If they were seized, they were unseized a week later. Matilda also complained to the Grants Committee that the Irish Government appealed a malicious injuries award as she wanted to use it for other property and the Department of Finance demanded she use it to repair Ballygroman House.[159](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote159anc) Only Matilda is mentioned as beneficiary in either of the Court reports, but she acknowledges her (half?) brother's interest in the Grants Committee submission. [160](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote160anc) <http://www.irishtimes.com/newspaper/archive/wit/1928/0512/Pg019.html#Ar01903> Irish Times Sat 12 May 1928[161](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote161anc) *'A time of revenge, a time of tragedy' Cork Hollybough,* 2002 Page 64.[162](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote162anc) <http://www.independent.ie/opinion/analysis/digging-up-the-other-hidden-ireland-134151.html>[163](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote163anc) *The Professor's House, Weekend*, Saturday February 22, 1997, Page 15.[164](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote164anc) National Archives Kew [http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/documentsonline/DoLUserDownload/bkeanefg@yahoocom/CAB/24/140/0/0018.pdf](http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/documentsonline/DoLUserDownload/bkeanefg%40yahoocom/CAB/24/140/0/0018.pdf) Reference Number CP 4318[165](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote165anc) <http://www.cairogang.com/other-people/british/castle-intelligence/incidents/kilgobnet%201922/kilgobnet-1922.html> I would like to thank Dr. A. Bielenberg for this reference that shows the driver of the Intelligence Officers was in fact a Catholic.[166](https://sites.google.com/site/protestantcork191136/home/advancing-the-story--reexamining-the-decline-with-minor-source-updates%22%20%5Cl%20%22sdfootnote166anc) *Irish Times* May 2 1922  |